

5. **3/09/1739/FP – Proposed alterations and first floor side extensions to both cottages at 1 and 2 Nursery Cottages, Kettle Green Road, Much Hadham, Herts, SG10 6AQ for Mr E. Landino and Mr A. Gaudio.**

Date of Receipt: 11.11.2009

Type: Full (Other)

Parish: MUCH HADHAM

Ward: MUCH HADHAM

Reason for report: Requested by Councillor Michael Carver

RECOMMENDATION

That planning permission be **REFUSED** for the following reasons:-

1. The proposed extensions by reason of their size, scale and siting, together with the extensions previously added to the properties would result in a pair of dwellings of excessive size, that would be incongruous within the surrounding street scene and out of keeping with the character and appearance of the original dwellings, to the detriment of the openness and rural character of the surrounding Rural Area. The proposal would thereby be contrary to Policies GBC3, ENV1, ENV5 and ENV6 of the East Herts Local Plan Second Review April 2007.

_____ (173909FP.LD)

1.0 Background

- 1.1 The application site is located within the Rural Area Beyond the Green Belt as shown on the attached OS extract.
- 1.2 This is a pair of two storey semi-detached dwellings which are situated along Kettle Green Road, to the West of Much Hadham. The properties are set within a large site with their own respective front and rear garden areas, which are predominantly laid-to-lawn. Each property benefits from vehicular access from Kettle Green Road leading to a detached double garage which is located at the side of the dwelling. The rear of the application site is bounded by a Nursery containing a number of greenhouses and other agricultural buildings.
- 1.3 The proposal is for alterations and first floor side extensions to both dwellings. The proposed first floor extensions would be located above the existing ground floor extensions that were previously added to both properties. Each of the proposed extensions would be 4.9 metres wide, 6.8

3/09/1739/FP

metres in height and 8.8 metres in depth, extending 2.0 metres beyond the front elevation and 1.2 metres beyond the rear elevation of both dwellings.

2.0 Site History

2.1 A ground floor extension to form a living room and porch was previously granted planning permission subject to conditions at each respective property (LPA Ref: 3/91/1855/FP, 3/91/1856/FP). Furthermore each dwelling has benefited from the grant of planning permission with conditions for a new detached garage and new vehicular access (LPA Ref: 3/05/0923/FP, 3/06/0893/FP). It was observed on a recent site visit that these permissions have been implemented at the application site.

3.0 Consultation Responses

3.1 No consultation responses have been received.

4.0 Parish Council Representations

4.1 Much Hadham Parish Council has not commented on the proposal.

5.0 Other Representations

5.1 The applications have been advertised by way of press notice, site notice and neighbour notification.

5.2 Mr J. F. Brothers of Dunloe, Little Hallingbury supports the proposal and comments that the efforts of the applicant in maintaining the adjacent Nursery business should be encouraged by permitting the extensions to each cottage and encourage the continuation of rural industry.

6.0 Policy

6.1 The relevant Local Plan policies in this application include the following:-

GBC3	Appropriate Development in the Rural Area Beyond the Green Belt
ENV1	Design and Environmental Quality
ENV5	Extensions to Dwellings
ENV6	Extensions to Dwellings – Criteria

7.0 Considerations

7.1 The determining issues in relation to this application are as follows:

- The principle of development;
- The impact of the proposed development on the character and appearance of the existing dwellings and surrounding area;
- The impact of the proposed development on the amenities of adjoining neighbouring occupiers;
- Highways/Access considerations.

Principle of Development

7.2 The application site is designated as falling within the Rural Area Beyond the Green Belt, wherein permission will not be given for the construction of new buildings or for changes of use other than for those purposes specified within Policy GBC3. Whilst there is no objection in principle to limited extensions or alterations to existing dwellings within the Rural Area, Policy ENV5 expects extensions to dwellings which fall outside the main settlements and Category 1 and 2 Villages to be of a scale and size that would either by itself, or cumulatively with other extensions, not disproportionately alter the size of the original dwelling nor intrude into the openness or rural qualities of the surrounding area.

7.3 It is considered that the proposed first floor extensions together with the previous existing extensions would represent a substantial addition to the this set of dwellings that would result in a large and prominent extension that would intrude into the openness and rural character of the surrounding Rural Area and would be detrimental to the character and appearance of the existing dwelling. It has been calculated that each of the original dwellings had a floor area of approximately 97 square metres. The previous planning permission granted for a ground floor extension to form a living room and porch at each respective dwelling (LPA Ref: 3/91/1855/FP, 3/91/1856/FP) represented an increase in the floor area by some 62 square metres, and the proposed first floor side extensions which forms the subject of this application would represent a further increase of approximately 43 square metres in the floor area of each of the dwellings. The current proposal together with previous additions to the dwellings would therefore result in an increase of approximately 102% in the original floor area of each respective dwelling, which it is considered would represent a substantial additions to the dwellings and would be out of keeping with, and detrimental to the openness and rural character of the surrounding Rural Area, contrary to Local Plan Policy GBC3.

The impact of the proposed development on the character and appearance of the existing dwelling and surrounding area

- 7.4 With regards to the impact of the proposed extension on the character and appearance of the existing dwelling, it is considered that the pair of semi-detached dwellings is situated in a prominent location along Kettle Green Road. The proposed extensions would project beyond the principal elevation of the dwellings by 2.0metres, creating bulky front and side elevations that would appear prominent and incongruous within the surrounding street scene and would be out of keeping with, and detrimental to the character and appearance of the existing dwelling.

The impact of the proposed development on the amenities of adjoining neighbouring occupiers

- 7.5 The application site is situated some 30 metres to the West of its nearest neighbour, the property known as Nursery Cottage, and immediately to the South is the Nursery business belonging to the applicants. To the North and West the application site is surrounded by open agricultural land, therefore it is considered that the proposed extensions would not be detrimental to the amenities of nearby residential occupiers.

Highways/Access considerations

- 7.6 The application properties each benefit from double detached garages and off-street parking which could accommodate 3 vehicles at each dwelling. There would be no changes to the existing parking or access arrangements at the application site and as such, it is considered that there would be sufficient parking to accommodate the proposed development in this particular location.

8.0 Conclusion

- 8.1 Having regard to the above considerations it is concluded that the proposed extensions by reason of their size, scale and siting, together with the extensions previously added to the properties would result in a pair of dwellings of excessive size, that would be incongruous within the surrounding street scene and out of keeping with the character and appearance of the original dwellings, to the detriment of the openness and rural character of the surrounding Rural Area. The proposal would thereby be contrary to Policies GBC3, ENV1, ENV5 and ENV6 of the East Herts Local Plan Second Review.

- 8.2 It is therefore recommended that planning permission be refused for the

3/09/1739/FP

reasons outlined at the head of the report.